

## **ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY**

INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

March 28, 2022

To: Terrence D. McCracken, Secretary to the Authority

From: Michael J. Quinn, Senior Distribution Engineer

Subject: Contract NC-042 Water System Improvements, Towns of Clarence ECWA Project No. 202100042

On Tuesday, March 15, 2022, the Authority received five (5) bids for the above referenced contract. The bids have been reviewed, a mathematical check has been performed, and the apparent lowest acceptable bidder is New Frontier Excavating & Paving, Inc. (New Frontier). Mathematical errors were found in the bids by Visone Construction, Inc. and DJM Contracting, Inc., however they did not change the ranking order of any of the bidders. Attached is Consultant's (Nussbaumer & Clarke, Inc.) letter of recommendation dated March 17, 2022 with bid tabulation for your use and information.

The references for New Frontier have been reviewed. New Frontier is an established contractor who has performed similar work for several Authority watermain replacement projects in an acceptable and competent manner. They have a good understanding of the scope and requirements for this contract.

New Frontier provided adequate WMBE documentation, approved by Director of EEO (ECWA), insurance, approved by Claims Representative/Risk Manager, and proof of apprenticeship program, approved by the Secretary to the Authority.

The Engineering Department, therefore, recommends award of Contract NC-042 to New Frontier Excavating & Paving, Inc. in the amount of \$2,366,040.00, subject to legal review.

Attached are the following documents:

- 1. ECWA Authorization Form.
- 2. ECWA Recommendation for Award of Contract form.
- 3. Consultant recommendation letter dated March 17, 2022 and bid tabulation.

## **Budget Information (work to be completed/paid in 2022):**

- Department 250 Engineering/Construction
- 2595 Eng/Const Transmission Mains
- Item 101598 NC-042 Transmission Main Replacement

MJQ:jmf Attachments cc: R.Stoll L.Kowalski W.Wheeler L.Lester CONT-NC-042-2101-X-12 March 17, 2022

Mr. William W. Wheeler, P.E. Distribution Engineer Erie County Water Authority 3030 Union Road Buffalo, NY 14227-1097



Re: Contract NC-42 Water System Improvements, Town of Clarence ECWA Project No. 202100042 Bidder Recommendation NCI File No. 20J1-0149

Dear Mr. Wheeler,

In accordance with the Notice to Bidders and New York State Contract Reporter Advertisement, sealed bids for the Water System Improvements, Town of Clarence were opened and read aloud at 10:00 a.m. on March 15, 2022, at the Erie County Water Authority's Union Road Office. A total of five (5) bids were received. Two (2) of the bids contained a minor math error. The correction is highlighted and explained in the bid tabulation. This correction did not change the low bidder. New Frontier Excavating & Paving, Inc. (New Frontier) remained the low bidder after the bid values were corrected, as stipulated in the contract documents.

The results are per the attached bid tabulation and are summarized as follows.

Bidder	Total Bid Amount
New Frontier Excavating & Paving, Inc.	\$ 2,366,040.00
Visone Construction Inc. (1)	\$ 2,453,950.90
4 <sup>th</sup> Generation Construction, Inc.	\$ 2,576,940.00
DJM Contracting, Inc. (1)	\$ 2,686,650.00
716 Site Contracting Inc.	\$ 2,816,748.00
(1) Corrected	

<sup>(1)</sup> Corrected

Nussbaumer & Clarke, Inc. (Nussbaumer) evaluated the bid for New Frontier. Pending the Erie County Water Authority's approval of the bidder's Bid Bond, MWBE submittal, and insurance, Nussbaumer recommends award of Contract NC-042, Water System Improvements, Town of Clarence to the lowest responsible bidder, New Frontier Excavating & Paving, Inc., in the total amount of \$2,366,040.00.

Should you have any questions or require additional information regarding this matter, please contact us at your convenience.

Sincerely,

NUSSBAUMER & CLARKE, INC.

hu

Darrell Jamieson Construction Administrator

c: File – 01 and 02

## ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY RECOMMENDATION FOR AWARD OF CONTRACT

Contract: Project Description:	NC-042 Project No.: 202100042 Water System Improvements								
r roject 2 esemptioni	Town of Clarence								
CONTRACT AWAR Contractor/Supplier: Award Amount:	D New Frontier Excavatin \$2,366,040.00	ig & Paving, In	с.						
BID SUMMARY: Date Advertised for E	Bids: 02/15/2022		Date of Bid Openi	ng 03/15/2022					
New Frontier Exca	Bidder wating & Paving, Inc.		Total Bid Amount \$2,366,040.00						
Visone Construction 4 <sup>th</sup> Generation Con	struction, Inc.		**\$2,453,950.90 \$2,576,940.00						
716 Site Contractin DJM Contracting,			\$2,816,748.00 **\$2,686,650.00						
			** Corrected amounts						
Attachments:	X Bid Tabulation		X Consultant's l	Recommendation					
APPROVALS (Selec									
Fu	) Waiver 11 Waiver	Λ							
A Affirmative A	rtial Waiver ction Officer	Navony	ater	Date <u>03/28/2022</u>					
INSURANCE APPR	OVAL								
X Claims Rep/R			Musaria	Date 03/28/2022					
NYS CERTIFIED AF	PRENTICESHIP PROG	RAM APPRO	VAL						
X Secretary to the	ne Authority	720)	fu	Date <u>3/29/22</u>					
Remarks:									

Erie County Water Authority NC-042 Water System Improvements Project		Engineer's Estimate of Probable Bid Price Paving, Inc.		•	g & Visone Construction, Inc.		4th Generation Construction, Inc.		716 Site Contracting, Inc.		DJM Contracting, Inc.		Average Bid Price				
Item Number	Description	Unit	Contract Quantity	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Average Unit Price	Average Total Price
	Ductile Iron Watermain Pipe								-								
1A2	6-inch Ductile Iron Watermain	LF	60	\$60.00	\$3,600.00	\$42.14	\$2,528.40	\$29.16	\$1,749.60	\$120.00	\$7,200.00	\$120.00	\$7,200.00	\$36.00	\$2,160.00	\$69.46	\$4,167.60
1A3	8-inch Ductile Iron Watermain	LF	4,400	\$90.00	\$396,000.00	\$123.45	\$543,180.00	\$114.32	\$503,008.00	\$130.00	\$572,000.00	\$155.50	\$684,200.00	\$103.00	\$453,200.00	\$125.25	\$551,117.60
1A5	12-inch Ductile Iron Watermain Valves	LF	4,130	\$125.00	\$516,250.00	\$149.32	\$616,691.60	\$119.99	\$495,558.70	\$140.00	\$578,200.00	\$178.50	\$737,205.00	\$130.00	\$536,900.00	\$143.56	\$592,911.06
2A1	4-inch Gate Valve	EA	2	\$1,800.00	\$3,600.00	\$1,077.70	\$2,155.40	\$1,050.85	\$2,101.70	\$3,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$1,900.00	\$3,800.00	\$1,900.00	\$3,800.00	\$1,785.71	\$3,571.42
2A1 2A2	8-inch Gate Valve	EA	24	\$1,800.00	\$48.000.00	\$1,882.40	\$45.177.60	\$1,924.58	\$46,189.92	\$5,000.00	\$120,000.00	\$1,700.00	\$40.800.00	\$8,100.00	\$194,400.00	\$3,721,40	\$89.313.50
2B1	12-inch Butterfly Valve	EA	14	\$2,500.00	\$35,000.00	\$2,298.63	\$32,180.82	\$2,561.78	\$35,864.92	\$7,000.00	\$98,000.00	\$2,100.00	\$29,400.00	\$12,000.00	\$168,000.00	\$5,192.08	\$72,689.15
2E1	Permanent Blow Off	EA	5	\$3,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$2,055.63	\$10,278.15	\$1,289.80	\$6,449.00	\$2,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$3,600.00	\$18,000.00	\$2,189.09	\$10,945.43
	Fire Hydrants																
3A	New Fire Hydrant Assembly	EA	16	\$6,500.00	\$104,000.00	\$6,459.21	\$103,347.36	\$8,153.90	\$130,462.40	\$10,000.00	\$160,000.00	\$7,100.00	\$113,600.00	\$10,300.00	\$164,800.00		
3C	Fire Hydrant Abandonment	EA	14	\$1,200.00	\$16,800.00	\$1,154.15	\$16,158.10	\$402.41	\$5,633.74	\$2,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$700.00	\$9,800.00	\$1,400.00	\$19,600.00	\$1,131.31	\$15,838.37
	l																
4A	Test Pits	EA	90	\$500.00	\$45,000.00	\$200.00	\$18,000.00	\$801.01	\$72,090.90	\$200.00	\$18,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$180,000.00	\$300.00	\$27,000.00	\$700.20	\$63,018.18
5A	Rock Excavation Rock Excavation	СҮ	30	\$150.00	\$0.00 \$4,500.00	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	\$162.00	\$4,860.00	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	\$152.40	\$4.572.00
JA	Fill		50	\$150.00	γ <del>-</del> ,500.00	¥130.00	φ <del>-</del> ,500.00	¥102.00		9130.00	φ <del>-</del> ,500.00		<del>ب،500.00</del>	4100.00	γ <del>.,</del> ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	¥152.40	97,972,00
6A	Select Backfill	CY	1,075	\$20.00	\$21,500.00	\$77.65	\$83,473.75	\$33.00	\$35,475.00	\$20.00	\$21,500.00	\$51.00	\$54,825.00	\$42.00	\$45,150.00	\$44.73	\$48,084.75
	Interconnections				\$0.00												
7A	Interconnection 1 - Ericson Dr & Harris Hill	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,620.00	\$6,620.00	\$16,561.98	\$16,561.98	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,400.00	\$6,400.00	\$22,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$14,316.40	\$14,316.40
7B	Interconnection 2 - Arondale & Main	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,650.00	\$6,650.00	\$16,529.63	\$16,529.63	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$13,835.93	\$13,835.93
7C	Interconnection 3 - Arondale & Vernon Circle	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$7,040.00	\$7,040.00	\$16,557.71	\$16,557.71	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,400.00	\$6,400.00	\$22,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$14,399.54	\$14,399.54
7D	Interconnection 4 - Arondale & Ericson (on Ericson-West)	LS LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,670.00 \$10,580.00	\$6,670.00 \$10,580.00	\$15,821.14	\$15,821.14	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00 \$20,000.00	\$6,500.00 \$10,800.00	\$6,500.00 \$10,800.00	\$22,000.00 \$28,000.00	\$22,000.00 \$28,000.00	\$14,198.23 \$17,696.41	\$14,198.23 \$17,696.41
7E 7F	Interconnection 5 - Shimerville and Greiner (on Greiner - West) Interconnection 6 - Shimerville and Greiner (on Greiner - East)	LS	1	\$20,000.00 \$20,000.00	\$20,000.00 \$20,000.00	\$10,580.00	\$8,410.00	\$19,102.03 \$17.410.73	\$19,102.03 \$17,410.73	\$20,000.00 \$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$7.000.00	\$10,800.00	\$22,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$17,696.41	\$17,696.41 \$14,964.15
7G	Interconnection 7 - Country Club	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,470.00	\$6,470.00	\$15,783.34	\$15,783.34	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6.800.00	\$6.800.00	\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$14,010.67	\$14,010.67
7H	Interconnection 7 - County Club Interconnection 8 - Shimerville & Woodside	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20.000.00	\$6,670.00	\$6,670.00	\$16,007.99	\$16,007.99	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,500.00	\$6,500.00	\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$14,035.60	\$14,035.60
7I	Interconnection 9 - Shimerville & Roll (South)	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$9,000.00	\$9,000.00	\$16,746.71	\$16,746.71	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$14,749.34	\$14,749.34
7J	Interconnection 10 - Shimerville & Roll (North)	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$7,210.00	\$7,210.00	\$17,229.29	\$17,229.29	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$7,100.00	\$7,100.00	\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$14,507.86	\$14,507.86
7K	Interconnection 11 - Elm & Clarence Cen. (on Clarence Cen - East)	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,520.00	\$6,520.00	\$15,809.26	\$15,809.26	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,400.00	\$6,400.00	\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$13,945.85	\$13,945.85
7L	Interconnection 12 - Elm & Clarence Cen. (on Clarence Cen - West)	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,600.00	\$6,600.00	\$17,650.49	\$17,650.49	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$6,400.00	\$6,400.00	\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$14,330.10	\$14,330.10
7M	Interconnection 13 - Shimerville & Greiner (Center) Water Service Connections	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$8,480.00	\$8,480.00	\$17,069.45	\$17,069.45	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$8,500.00	\$8,500.00	\$20,500.00	\$20,500.00	\$14,909.89	\$14,909.89
8A1	3/4" to 1" Service Installation	EA	122	\$2,300.00	\$280.600.00	\$1.782.55	\$217.471.10	\$1.691.00	\$206.302.00	\$2.000.00	\$244.000.00	\$2.050.00	\$250.100.00	\$2.155.00	\$262.910.00	\$1.935.71	\$236.156.62
8A2	1-1/2' and Larger Service Installation	EA	4	\$2,500.00	\$10.000.00	\$5,576.66	\$22,306.64	\$4.694.79	\$18.779.16	\$4,000.00	\$16,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$16,000.00	\$3.800.00	\$15,200.00	\$4,414.29	\$17,657.16
8C1	Additional 3/4" to 1" Copper Tubing	LF	1,290	\$10.00	\$12,900.00	\$7.35	\$9,481.50	\$6.24	\$8,049.60	\$20.00	\$25,800.00	\$13.00	\$16,770.00	\$6.50	\$8,385.00	\$10.62	\$13,697.22
8C2	Additional 1-1/2" and Larger Copper Tubing	LF	100	\$12.00	\$1,200.00	\$24.14	\$2,414.00	\$20.52	\$2,052.00	\$40.00	\$4,000.00	\$25.00	\$2,500.00	\$22.00	\$2,200.00	\$26.33	\$2,633.20
	Abandonments																
10A	Abandonment 1 - Ericson Drive & Harris Hill	LS	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,830.00	\$5,830.00	\$3,096.45	\$3,096.45	\$8,000.00	\$8,000.00	\$6,300.00	\$6,300.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$7,645.29	\$7,645.29
10B	Abandonment 2 - Elm & Clarence Cen. (on Elm)	LS	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$3,098.46	\$3,098.46	\$8,000.00	\$8,000.00	\$6,400.00	\$6,400.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$7,899.69	\$7,899.69
10C	Abandonment 3 - Susan to Clardon Restoration	LS	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$7,009.42	\$7,009.42	\$7,406.73	\$7,406.73	\$8,000.00	\$8,000.00	\$13,500.00	\$13,500.00	\$1,800.00	\$1,800.00	\$7,543.23	\$7,543.23
11A1	Concrete Restoration - Sidewalk	SY	140	\$75.00	\$10,500.00	\$116.52	\$16.312.80	\$116.64	\$16,329.60	\$100.00	\$14,000.00	\$60.00	\$8.400.00	\$65.00	\$9,100.00	\$91.63	\$12.828.48
11A1	Concrete Restoration - Sudewark	LF	40	\$75.00	\$3,000.00	\$75.00	\$3,000.00	\$162.00	\$6,480.00	\$75.00	\$3,000.00	\$75.00	\$3,000.00	\$75.00	\$3,000.00	\$92.40	\$3,696.00
11B2	Asphalt Restoration - Driveway	SY	840	\$75.00	\$63,000.00	\$57.26	\$48,098.40	\$41.28	\$34,675.20	\$10.00	\$8,400.00	\$33.00	\$27,720.00	\$30.00	\$25,200.00	\$34.31	\$28,818.72
11B4A	Asphalt Restoration - Pavement 2 inches Binder Course (Erie County)	SY	60	\$5.00	\$300.00	\$28.60	\$1,716.00	\$48.55	\$2,913.00	\$20.00	\$1,200.00	\$100.00	\$6,000.00	\$19.00	\$1,140.00	\$43.23	\$2,593.80
11B4B	Asphalt Restoration - Pavement 2.5 inches Binder Course (Clarence)	SY	970	\$5.00	\$4,850.00	\$19.00	\$18,430.00	\$36.86	\$35,754.20	\$15.00	\$14,550.00	\$30.00	\$29,100.00	\$15.00	\$14,550.00	\$23.17	\$22,476.84
11B5	Asphalt Restoration - Pavement 4 inches Base Course (Erie County & Clarence)	SY	1,030	\$5.00	\$5,150.00	\$30.13	\$31,033.90	\$43.57	\$44,877.10	\$18.00	\$18,540.00	\$46.50	\$47,895.00	\$20.50	\$21,115.00	\$31.74	\$32,692.20
11B6	Asphalt Restoration - Cold Milling & Paving of Asphalt Pavement Top Course	SY	9,200	\$5.00	\$46,000.00	\$16.67	\$153,364.00	\$16.68	\$153,456.00	\$8.00	\$73,600.00	\$18.00	\$165,600.00	\$13.75	\$126,500.00	\$14.62	\$134,504.00
11B7A 11C1	Asphalt Restoration - Subbase Course (Erie County & Clarence)) Landscape Restoration - Landscaping	CY LF	335 5.890	\$30.00 \$3.00	\$10,050.00 \$17,670.00	\$41.60 \$10.45	\$13,936.00 \$61,550,50	\$43.20 \$16.07	\$14,472.00 \$94.652.30	\$40.00 \$3.00	\$13,400.00 \$17,670.00	\$50.00 \$12.70	\$16,750.00 \$74.803.00	\$47.00 \$8.50	\$15,745.00 \$50,065.00	\$44.36 \$10.14	\$14,860.60 \$59,748.16
	Landscape Restoration - Tree Planting	EA	27	\$3.00	\$2,700.00	\$10.45	\$2,700.00	\$10.07	\$21,870.27	\$500.00	\$13,500.00	\$100.00	\$2,700.00	\$450.00	\$12,150.00	\$392.00	\$10.584.05
11C3	Landscape Restoration - Tree Removal - Less than 12-inch diameter	EA	13	\$100.00	\$1,300.00	\$100.00	\$1,300.00	\$108.00	\$1,404.00	\$100.00	\$1,300.00	\$100.00	\$1,300.00	\$200.00	\$2,600.00	\$121.60	\$1,580.80
11C4	Landscape Restoration - Tree Removal - Greater than 12-inch diameter	EA	17	\$100.00	\$1,700.00	\$100.00	\$1,700.00	\$108.00	\$1,836.00	\$100.00	\$1,700.00	\$100.00	\$1,700.00	\$700.00	\$11,900.00	\$221.60	\$3,767.20
	Testing and Disinfection																
12A	Testing and Disinfection	LF	8,560	\$5.00	\$42,800.00	\$3.90	\$33,384.00	\$3.24	\$27,734.40	\$3.00	\$25,680.00	\$3.00	\$25,680.00	\$3.00	\$25,680.00	\$3.23	\$27,631.68
	Extra work Items	1	400		A	A.C	A		A	A46.55		446.55		A40.00	A		
13A 13B	Extra Excavation (8 to 10 feet deep) Extra Excavation (10 to 12 feet deep)	LF LF	400 100	\$10.00 \$20.00	\$4,000.00 \$2,000.00	\$10.00 \$20.00	\$4,000.00 \$2,000.00	\$10.80 \$21.60	\$4,320.00 \$2,160.00	\$10.00 \$20.00	\$4,000.00 \$2,000.00	\$10.00 \$20.00	\$4,000.00 \$2,000.00	\$10.00 \$20.00	\$4,000.00 \$2,000.00	\$10.16 \$20.32	\$4,064.00 \$2,032.00
13B 13C	Extra Excavation (10 to 12 feet deep)	CY	40	\$20.00	\$4,000.00	\$20.00	\$4,000.00	\$21.60	\$2,160.00	\$150.00	\$6,000.00	\$100.00	\$4,000.00	\$100.00	\$2,000.00	\$133.20	\$2,032.00
14A	Repair Crew Labor and Equipment	HRS	96	\$150.00	\$14,400.00	\$150.00	\$14,400.00	\$716.05	\$68,740.80	\$600.00	\$57,600.00	\$150.00	\$14,400.00	\$150.00	\$14,400.00	\$353.21	\$33,908.16
15A	Vacuum Truck and Labor	HRS	24	\$125.00	\$3,000.00	\$375.44	\$9,010.56	\$297.00	\$7,128.00	\$150.00	\$3,600.00	\$125.00	\$3,000.00	\$125.00	\$3,000.00	\$214.49	\$5,147.71
16A	Contingency Allowance	LS	1	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00
L		Т	otal Construction Cost:	\$2,12	5,370.00	\$2,3	56,040.00	\$2,4	53,950.90	\$2,576,	,940.00	\$2,816	,748.00	\$2,680	,650.00	\$2,445	,623.83

Note: Contractor did not include price in total bid amount.

Note:

The Contractor had a discrepancy between numeric unit prices and written unit prices. The written unit price for a few bid items reflected the total bid amount for that individual item and not the numeric unit price. The numeric unit prices were used in the bid analysis to compute the total price bid.

Contractor did not change quantities as per Addendum No. 1

Bid Form \$ 2,454,760.90

-\$810.00

Bid Form

\$3,000,630.00

-\$313,980.00