



ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY
INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

April 3, 2024

To: Terrence D. McCracken, Secretary to the Authority

From: William W. Wheeler, PE, Senior Distribution Engineer

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to be "W.W. Wheeler", is written over the name of the sender.

Subject: Contract GP-011
Water System Improvements
Union Road Corridor Distribution System
Towns of West Seneca and Cheektowaga, NY
ECWA Project No. 202200057

On Tuesday, March 19, 2024, the Authority received three (3) bids for the above referenced contract. The bids have been reviewed, a mathematical check has been performed, and the apparent low bidder, E&R General Construction, Inc. (E&R), was found acceptable. A mathematical error was found in the highest bidder's calculations (716 Site Contracting, Inc.) however this did not change their position as the highest bidder.

E&R is an established contractor for the Authority who has worked on numerous ECWA contracts, performing work of similar nature in a competent, reliable, and acceptable manner. They have demonstrated a good understanding of the scope and requirements for this contract.

The total Engineer's estimate for the contract was \$723,905.00. The bid submitted by E&R is \$816,765.00, approximately 12.8% above the estimated amount. We find this bid to be reasonable given the current construction market, contractor availability and material availability and pricing.

E&R has provided adequate MWBE documentation, approved by Director of Administration, insurance, approved by Claims Representative/Risk Manager, and proof of apprenticeship program, approved by the Coordinator of Employee Relations.

We, therefore, recommend award of the above referenced contract to E&R General Construction, Inc. in the amount of \$816,765.00.

Budget Information (2024 Construction):

Unit: 2590 Engineering/Construction Distribution Mains
Item: 101675 GP-011 Distribution System Upgrades

This phase of the project was not originally considered for construction in 2024 and therefore inadequate funds were budgeted. Subsequent to the budget development process, the Authority was notified that a grant was awarded from the 26th Congressional District office to fund this phase of the work. Therefore, additional funds for this project will be made available through a budget

To: Terrence D. McCracken
Secretary to the Authority

- 2 -

April 3, 2024

transfer from the 2024 capital budget as part of a separate Board approval request on the agenda for the April 18, 2024 meeting.

Attached please find the following documents:

1. ECWA Authorization Form.
2. ECWA Recommendation for Award of Contract form.
3. Letter of recommendation from GPI, dated March 20, 2024 and Bid Tabulation.

MJQ:jmf

Attachments

cc: L.Kowalski, PE

M.Quinn, PE

L.Lester

CONT-GP-011-2201-X-12

**ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY
RECOMMENDATION FOR AWARD OF CONTRACT**

Contract: GP-011 Project No.: 202200057
 Project Description: Water System Improvements
Union Road Corridor Distribution System, Towns of West Seneca and Cheektowaga

CONTRACT AWARD

Contractor/Supplier: E&R General Construction, Inc.
 Award Amount: \$816,765.00

BID SUMMARY:

Date Advertised for Bids: 02/22/2024 Date of Bid Opening 03/19/2024

Bidder	Total Bid Amount
<u>E&R General Construction, Inc.</u>	<u>\$816,765.00</u>
<u>Concrete Applied Technologies Corp. (CATCO)</u>	<u>\$887,470.00</u>
<u>716 Site Contracting, Inc.</u>	<u>** \$1,168,900.00</u>
	<u>** Corrected Amount</u>

Attachments: Bid Tabulation Consultant's Recommendation

APPROVALS (Select applicable)

WMBE APPROVAL

No Waiver
 Full Waiver
 Partial Waiver

EEO Compliance Officer *Savanya Lester* Date 04/02/2024

INSURANCE APPROVAL

Claims Rep/Risk Manager *Molly G. Masara* Date 4/3/2024

NYS CERTIFIED APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAM APPROVAL

Coordinator of Employee Relations *V. J. [Signature]* Date 04/03/2024

Remarks: Unit price contract.

BID TABULATION

PREPARED FOR:
ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY
 Water System Improvements - Union Road Corridor Distribution System
 Town of West Seneca and Cheektowaga, NY
 CONTRACT GP-011
 ECWA PROJECT NO. 202200057

PREPARED BY:
GREENMAN-PEDERSEN, INC.
 GPI PROJ. NO. WNY-2200020.00
 BY: PAUL CASE, P.E.
 DATE: MARCH 20, 2024

BID OPENING - MARCH 19, 2024												COMMENTS
				ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		E & R GENERAL CONSTRUCTION, INC.		CONCRETE APPLIED TECHNOLOGIES CORP. (CATCO)		716 SITE CONTRACTING, INC.		
ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	CONTRACT QUANTITY	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	
1A2	Furnish and Install 6 -inch DIP	LF	60	\$100.00	\$6,000.00	\$150.00	\$9,000.00	\$400.00	\$24,000.00	\$300.00	\$18,000.00	
1A3	Furnish and Install 8 -inch DIP	LF	580	\$200.00	\$116,000.00	\$270.00	\$156,600.00	\$300.00	\$174,000.00	\$400.00	\$232,000.00	
1A5	Furnish and Install 12 -inch DIP	LF	380	\$400.00	\$152,000.00	\$350.00	\$133,000.00	\$450.00	\$171,000.00	\$600.00	\$228,000.00	
2A2	Furnish and Install 8-inch Gate Valves	Each	3	\$3,000.00	\$9,000.00	\$8,200.00	\$24,600.00	\$4,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$9,000.00	
2B1	Furnish and Install 12-inch Butterfly Valves	Each	4	\$4,500.00	\$18,000.00	\$11,000.00	\$44,000.00	\$7,500.00	\$30,000.00	\$3,500.00	\$14,000.00	
3A	Furnish and Install New Hydrant Assemblies	Each	1	\$9,000.00	\$9,000.00	\$9,600.00	\$9,600.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	
3C	Fire Hydrant Abandonments	Each	1	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$4,800.00	\$4,800.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	
4A	Test Pit Excavation and Backfill	Each	20	\$1,500.00	\$30,000.00	\$200.00	\$4,000.00	\$435.00	\$8,700.00	\$4,500.00	\$90,000.00	
5A	Rock Excavation	CY	80	\$200.00	\$16,000.00	\$1.00	\$80.00	\$1.00	\$80.00	\$120.00	\$9,600.00	
6A	Furnish and Install Select Backfill	CY	800	\$45.00	\$36,000.00	\$46.00	\$36,800.00	\$80.00	\$64,000.00	\$200.00	\$160,000.00	
7A	Interconnection No. 1 - Union Road Near Station UR 46+50± (South of Seneca Street)	LS	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	
7B	Interconnection No. 2 - Union Road at Seneca Street Intersection (East Side)	LS	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	
7C	Interconnection No. 3 - Union Road at Seneca Street Intersection (West Side)	LS	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$42,000.00	\$42,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	
7D	Interconnection No. 4 - Union Road Near Station UR 49+35± (North of Seneca Street)	LS	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	
7E	Interconnection No. 5 - Union Road at South Side of Slate Bottom Creek (Station UR 218+40±)	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	
7F	Interconnection No. 6 - Union Road at North Side of Slate Bottom Creek (Station UR 223+08±)	LS	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$37,000.00	\$37,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	
8A1	Service Replacement/Installations 3/4 inch to 1-inch	Each	2	\$4,000.00	\$8,000.00	\$7,800.00	\$15,600.00	\$15,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$24,000.00	
8B1	Furnish and Install 3/4 inch to 1 inch Additional Copper tubing	LF	130	\$10.00	\$1,300.00	\$8.00	\$1,040.00	\$75.00	\$9,750.00	\$10.00	\$1,300.00	Computed Total For This Item On 716's Bid Form is shown as \$16,900.00
11A1	Furnish and Install Concrete Sidewalk	SY	300	\$60.00	\$18,000.00	\$94.00	\$28,200.00	\$110.00	\$33,000.00	\$110.00	\$33,000.00	
11A2	Furnish and Install Concrete Driveway	SY	30	\$120.00	\$3,600.00	\$115.00	\$3,450.00	\$165.00	\$4,950.00	\$200.00	\$6,000.00	
11A3	Furnish and Install Concrete Base Course (8" depth)	SY	350	\$150.00	\$52,500.00	\$130.00	\$45,500.00	\$120.00	\$42,000.00	\$200.00	\$70,000.00	
11A4	Furnish and Install Concrete Curb/Gutter	LF	15	\$75.00	\$1,125.00	\$45.00	\$675.00	\$150.00	\$2,250.00	\$110.00	\$1,650.00	
11B2	Furnish and Install Asphalt Driveway	SY	20	\$50.00	\$1,000.00	\$52.00	\$1,040.00	\$300.00	\$6,000.00	\$300.00	\$6,000.00	
11B3	Furnish and Install Asphalt Pavement Top Course (1-1/2" thickness)	SY	50	\$10.00	\$500.00	\$18.00	\$900.00	\$45.00	\$2,250.00	\$200.00	\$10,000.00	
11B4	Furnish and Install Asphalt Pavement Binder Course (3" thickness)	SY	800	\$20.00	\$16,000.00	\$33.00	\$26,400.00	\$47.00	\$37,600.00	\$40.00	\$32,000.00	
11B5	Furnish and Install Asphalt Pavement Base Course (4" thickness)	SY	50	\$25.00	\$1,250.00	\$36.00	\$1,800.00	\$48.00	\$2,400.00	\$300.00	\$15,000.00	
11B6	Cold Milling and Placement of Asphalt Top Course (1-1/2" thickness)	SY	200	\$30.00	\$6,000.00	\$30.00	\$6,000.00	\$40.00	\$8,000.00	\$100.00	\$20,000.00	
11C1	Landscape Restoration-Lawn	LF	510	\$5.00	\$2,550.00	\$2.00	\$1,020.00	\$11.00	\$5,610.00	\$15.00	\$7,650.00	
12A	Testing and Disinfection	LF	1020	\$4.00	\$4,080.00	\$3.00	\$3,060.00	\$12.00	\$12,240.00	\$5.00	\$5,100.00	
13A	Extra Excavation (8-10 feet Deep)	LF	40	\$20.00	\$800.00	\$25.00	\$1,000.00	\$36.00	\$1,440.00	\$25.00	\$1,000.00	
13B	Extra Excavation (10-12 feet Deep)	LF	40	\$25.00	\$1,000.00	\$35.00	\$1,400.00	\$50.00	\$2,000.00	\$35.00	\$1,400.00	
13C	Furnish and Install Extra Concrete	CY	20	\$350.00	\$7,000.00	\$350.00	\$7,000.00	\$700.00	\$14,000.00	\$350.00	\$7,000.00	
13D	Furnish and Install Flowable Fill	CY	14	\$300.00	\$4,200.00	\$300.00	\$4,200.00	\$350.00	\$4,900.00	\$300.00	\$4,200.00	
14A	Repair Crew Labor & Equipment	HR	40	\$150.00	\$6,000.00	\$150.00	\$6,000.00	\$485.00	\$19,400.00	\$150.00	\$6,000.00	
15A	Vacuum Truck & Labor	HR	40	\$125.00	\$5,000.00	\$125.00	\$5,000.00	\$360.00	\$14,400.00	\$125.00	\$5,000.00	
16A	Contingency Allowance	LS	1	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	
TOTAL AMOUNT					\$723,905.00		* \$816,765.00		\$887,470.00		** \$1,168,900.00	
						MATCHES TOTAL BID AMOUNT AS INDICATED ON SUBMITTED BID FORMS		MATCHES TOTAL BID AMOUNT AS INDICATED ON SUBMITTED BID FORMS		** CORRECTED TOTAL BID AMOUNT ABOVE DIFFERS FROM AMOUNT INDICATED ON SUBMITTED BID FORMS OF \$1,184,500.00		
						* APPARENT LOW BID						

March 20, 2024

Erie County Water Authority
3030 Union Road
Cheektowaga, NY 14227

Attn: Leonard F. Kowalski, P.E. – Executive Engineer

**RE: Review of Bids and Recommendation of Award
Erie County Water Authority
Contract No. GP-011
Water System Improvements
Union Road Corridor Distribution System
Town of West Seneca and Cheektowaga, NY
ECWA Project No. 202200057
GPI Project No. WNY-2200020.00**

Dear Mr. Kowalski:

On March 19, 2024 Erie County Water Authority received a total of three (3) bids for the above referenced project, as follows:

<u>Name of Company Submitting Bid</u>	<u>Total Bid Amount</u>
E&R General Construction, Inc.	\$ 816,765.00
Concrete Applied Technologies Corp. (CATCO)	\$ 887,470.00
716 Site Contracting, Inc.	\$1,168,900.00 (Corrected Bid Amount - See Review Comments Below)

For comparison purposes, the Engineer's Estimate for the contract was \$723,905.00.

GPI prepared a Bid Tabulation (enclosed herewith), performed a mathematical check, reviewed said bids, and we offer the following comments:

- 1: E&R General Construction, Inc. – Is the apparent low bidder. The bid received in the amount of \$816,765.00 was found to be mathematically correct (as shown on the enclosed Bid Tabulation). The bid appears to be complete see attached Bid Document Information Reviewed By GPI.
- 2: Concrete Applied Technologies Corp. (CATCO) – Is the apparent 2nd place bidder. The bid received in the amount of \$887,470.00 was found to be mathematically correct (as shown on the enclosed Bid Tabulation). The bid appears to be complete see attached Bid Document Information Reviewed By GPI.
- 3: 716 Site Contracting, Inc. – Is the apparent 3rd place bidder. The bid received contained recording / mathematical errors. For Bid Item 8B1, page 00410-8 of the Bid Form shows a computed total of \$16,900 which is incorrect. The corrected computed total is \$1300.00 (130 LF@ \$10.00/LF). As such, the corrected Total Bid Amount is \$ 1,168,900.00 and not \$1,184,500.00 as indicated on the submitted Bid Form (see the enclosed Bid Tabulation). This does not change 716 Site Contracting, Inc.'s position in the Bid Rankings. The bid appears to be complete see attached Bid Document Information Reviewed By GPI.

We talked with the apparent low bidder, Angiolina Passucci – Vice President of E&R General Construction, Inc., to discuss their understanding of the project, and their capabilities to perform the work. E&R General Construction, Inc. is a very reputable and well qualified Contractor that has been performing similar work for Erie County Water Authority and other Municipalities over their 40-years in business.

Based on the information available to us, it is GPI's recommendation that the Erie County Water Authority award ECWA Contract GP-011 to E&R General Construction, Inc. for their Bid Amount of Eight Hundred Sixteen Thousand, Seven Hundred Sixty-Five Dollars and Zero Cents (\$816,765.00), contingent upon Erie County Water Authority - Legal Department review and determination of a complete bid.

Please contact us if you have any questions or require any additional information.

Sincerely,

GPI/GREENMAN-PEDERSEN, INC.



Paul C. Case, P.E., LEED AP
Senior Civil Engineer

4950 Genesee Street, Suite 100, Buffalo, NY 14225
Phone: 716-989-3323 | Email: pcase@gpinet.com

Enclosures: Bid Tabulation
Bid Document Information Reviewed By GPI / ECWA Legal Checklist's For:

- E&R General Construction, Inc.
- Concrete Applied Technologies Corporation (CATCO)
- 716 Site Contracting, Inc.

cc: Michael Quinn, P.E., BCEE – Senior Distribution Engineer (ECWA)
William Wheeler, P.E. – Senior Distribution Engineer (ECWA)
Mark Jarmuz – Distribution Engineer (ECWA)