

ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY

INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

March 12, 2024

To: Terrence D. McCracken, Secretary to the Authority

From: Clayton J. Johnson, PE, Production Engineer

Subject: Contract W-035-A

Storage Tank Refurbishing

Gartman, Chestnut Ridge, Sturgeon Point Clearwells

ECWA Project No. 202300060

On Tuesday, February 13, 2024, the Authority received three (3) bids for the above referenced contract. The bids have been reviewed, a mathematical check has been performed, and the apparent low bidder, Amstar of WNY, Inc. (Amstar), was found acceptable.

Amstar is an established contractor for the Authority who has previously worked on ECWA tank refurbishment contracts, performing the work in a competent, reliable, and acceptable manner. They have demonstrated a good understanding of the scope and requirements for this contract.

The contract includes Base Bid and Alternate Bid Items; Amstar bid was low for the base bids as well as the selected alternate items.

Amstar has provided adequate insurance, approved by the Claims Representative/Risk Manager, and proof of apprenticeship program, approved by the Coordinator of Employee Relations. MWBE documentation is currently under review by the Director of Administration.

We, therefore, recommend the award of the above referenced contract for the Base Bid and Alternate Bids Items 1.1A, 1.8A, 2.5 A, 3.4A, and 4.4A in the amount of \$1,229,350.00 to Amstar of WNY, Inc., conditioned on the approval of MWBE documentation prior to March 21, 2024.

Budget Information (2023 Construction):

Department No.: 250 – Engineering/Construction

Unit 2502: Construction

Item No. 74: Payments to Contractors-Tanks (\$5,010,000.00 total item budget)

Attached please find the following documents:

- 1. ECWA Authorization Form.
- 2. ECWA Recommendation for Award of Contract form.
- 3. Letter of recommendation from Wendel, dated March 1, 2024, and Bid Tabulation.

CJJ:jmf
Attachments
cc: L.Kowalski
L.Lester

CONT-W-035-A-2101-X-12



March 1, 2024

Mr. Clayton Johnson, PE Erie County Water Authority 3030 Union Road Cheektowaga, NY 14227-1097

SUBJECT: ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY

STORAGE TANK REFURBISHING - GARTMAN, CHESTNUT RIDGE, STURGEON POINT CLEARWELLS

CONTRACT No.: W-035A

RECOMMENDATION OF AWARD ECWA PROJ. NO. 202300060 WENDEL PROJ. NO. 239844

Dear Mr. Johnson:

Three (3) bids on the above referenced project were received and opened on February 13, 2024, in accordance with the Notice to Bidders previously authorized.

A summary of the bids is attached for your reference. After review of the bids, Wendel recommends award of the Base Bid and Alternate Bid Items No. 1.1A, 1.8A, 2.5A, 3.4A and 4.4A for Contract No. W-035A Storage Tank Refurbishing: Gartman, Chestnut Ridge, Sturgeon Point Clearwells to Amstar of Western New York, Inc. (Amstar) based upon their low Base Bid and Alternate Item No. 1.1A, 1.8A, 2.5A, 3.4A and 4.4A of \$1,229,350.00.

BASE BID	\$	712,350.00
ALTERNATE BIDS TO INCLUDE		
1.1A Gartman Interior Painting - In lieu of item 1.1 for Full Recoat	\$	270,000.00
Less Item 1.1 Interior Painting – Spot Repair & Sacrificial Anode System	(\$	132,000.00)
1.8A Gartman Disposal of Wet Interior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	\$	8,000.00
2.5A Chestnut Ridge Exterior Painting - Shell Spot Repair & Shell Overcoat	\$	123,000.00
3.4A Sturgeon Point East Exterior Painting Architectural Coating	\$	124,000.00
4.4A Sturgeon Point West Exterior Painting Architectural Coating	\$	124,000.00
TANK TOTALS - BASE BID & ALL ALTERNATES	\$	1 229 350 00

We have had a discussion with Amstar and reviewed their understanding of the scope and requirements of this project. We are confident that they have a clear understanding of the project and they indicated that they are comfortable with their bid price.

Sincerely, WENDEL

Timothy G. Walck, PE

Timothy I Elele C

Enclosure

CC via email: Michael Wymer, PE - ECWA

Leonard Kowalski, PE - ECWA

Catherine Knab, PE, PMP – JMD

Jaime Davidson, PE – JMD Lauren Glose. PE - Wendel

SUMMARY PAG	E FOR COMPARISON ONLY ECWA Storage Tank Refurbishing: Gartman, Chestnut Ridge,												
PROJECT:	Sturgeon Point Clearwells		TABLE ATION OF B	10.0									
CONTRACT : DATE :	W-035A February 16, 2024		TABULATION OF B	IDS									
			NO American of		AH D-i	NO.		NA/ = rel elici de		0.3			D. 4
++ INDICATES	CONTRACTOR ERROR		Amstar of Cheektov	vaga, NY		Amhers	,	vvoridwid	Butle	stries Corporation er, PA		Engineer	s Estimate
			Ye			Yes				es			E)(TELIDED
ITEM#	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY UNITS	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL	UN PRI		EXTENDED TOTAL	_	NIT ICE	EXTENDED TOTAL		UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL
BASE BID													
1.1	GARTMAN TANK Interior Painting - Spot Repair & Sacrificial Anode System	1 LS	\$ 132,000.00 \$	132,000.00	0 \$ 175,000.0	00 \$	175,000.00	0 \$ 93,612.	.00 \$	93,612.00	0	43,700.00	43,700.00
1.2 1.3	Shell Plate and Floor Repair - Cover Plate Steel Plate Butt Weld Repair	2 SF 5 LS	\$ 300.00 \$ \$ 150.00 \$		0 \$ 3,000.0 0 \$ 700.0	00 \$ 00 \$	6,000.00 +-		.00 \$	1,800.00 675.00	0	1,150.00 345.00	2,300.00 1,725.00
1.4 1.5	Pit Welding Epoxy Seam Sealing & Pit Filling	10 EA 2 GAL	\$ 20.00 \$ \$ 400.00 \$	200.00		00 \$	5,000.00		.00 \$	400.00 2,000.00	0	345.00 345.00	3,450.00 690.00
1.6	Miscellanious Modifications	1 LS	\$ 60,000.00 \$	60,000.00	0 \$ 140,000.0	00 \$	140,000.00	0 \$ 90,320.	.00 \$	90,320.00	0	70,150.00	70,150.00
1.7	Contingency Allowance for Repairs (LUMP SUM)	1 LS	\$ 30,000.00 \$	30,000.00	0 \$ 30,000.0	00 \$	30,000.00	0 \$ 30,000.	.00 \$	30,000.00	0	34,500.00	34,500.00
2.1	CHESTNUT RIDGE TANK Exterior Painting - Roof Spot Repair and Roof Overcoat	1 LS	\$ 57,200.00 \$	57,200.00	0 \$ 120,000.0	00 \$	120,000.00	0 \$ 37,940.	.00 \$	37,940.00	0	141,450.00	141,450.00
2.2 2.3	Disposal of Exterior Hazardous Residue for Spot Repair Miscellanious Modifications	1 LS 1 LS	\$ 1,800.00 \$ \$ 55,000.00 \$,	0 \$ 1,000.0 0 \$ 76,000.0			0 \$ 3,700. 0 \$ 84,875.		3,700.00 84,875.00	0	1,150.00 35,650.00	1,150.00 35,650.00
2.4	Contingency Allowance for Repairs (LUMP SUM)	1 LS	\$ 50,000.00 \$,	0 \$ 50,000.0			0 \$ 50,000		50,000.00	0	57,500.00	57,500.00
	STURGEON POINT EAST CLEARWELL TANK												
3.1 3.2	Exterior Cleaning Miscellanious Modifications	1 LS 1 LS	\$ 72,000.00 \$ \$ 70,000.00 \$		0 \$ 145,000.0 0 \$ 120,000.0			0 \$ 125,500. 0 \$ 96,700.		125,500.00 96,700.00	0	92,000.00 42,550.00	92,000.00 42,550.00
3.3	Contingency Allowance for Repairs (LUMP SUM)	1 LS	\$ 20,000.00 \$		0 \$ 20,000.0			0 \$ 20,000		20,000.00	0	23,000.00	23,000.00
0	STURGEON POINT WEST CLEARWELL TANK										_		
4.1 4.2	Exterior Cleaning Miscellanious Modifications	1 LS 1 LS	\$ 72,000.00 \$ \$ 70,000.00 \$		0 \$ 145,000.0 0 \$ 120,000.0		,	0 \$ 125,500. 0 \$ 96,700.		125,500.00 96,700.00	0	92,000.00 42,550.00	92,000.00 42,550.00
4.3	Contingency Allowance for Repairs (LUMP SUM)	1 LS	\$ 20,000.00 \$	20,000.00	0 \$ 20,000.0	00 \$	20,000.00	0 \$ 20,000.	.00 \$	20,000.00	0	23,000.00	23,000.00
BASE BID			CTOR TOTAL=:\$ CTUAL TOTAL=:\$	712350.00 712350.00	0 CON TOTAL= 0 ACT TOTAL=		1178000.00 +- 1178500.00	+ CON TOTAL 0 ACT TOTAL:		879722.00 879722.00	-	CON TOTAL=\$ ACT TOTAL=\$	707365.00 707365.00
MIN BID =	\$ 712,350.00	1	BID RANKING		0 BID RANKING		3	BID RANKIN		2		BID RANKING	101000.00
ALTERNATE BIL													
1.1A	GARTMAN TANK Interior Painting - In lieu of item 1.1 for Full Recoat	1 LS	270,000.00	270,000.00	0 450,000	.00	450,000.00	256,410	0.00	256,410.00	0	264,500.00	264,500.00
1.8A	Disposal of Wet Interior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	1 LS	8,000.00	8,000.00	0 1,000	.00	1,000.00	6,100	0.00	6,100.00	0	5,750.00	5,750.00
2.5A	CHESTNUT RIDGE TANK Exterior Painting - Shell Spot Repair & Shell Overcoat	1 LS	123,000.00	123,000.00	0 100.000	00	100,000.00	0 126,518	2 00	126,518.00	0	299,000.00	299,000.00
2.5A		1 23	123,000.00	123,000.00	100,000	.00	100,000.00	120,510	5.00	120,310.00	U	299,000.00	299,000.00
3.4A	STURGEON POINT EAST CLEARWELL TANK Exterior Painting - Architectural Coating	1 LS	124,000.00	124,000.00	0 145,000	.00	145,000.00	123,640	0.00	123,640.00	0	224,250.00	224,250.00
	STURGEON POINT WEST CLEARWELL TANK												
4.4A	Exterior Painting - Architectural Coating	1 LS	124,000.00	124,000.00	0 145,000	.00	145,000.00	123,640	0.00	123,640.00	0	224,250.00	224,250.00
			ACTOR TOTAL=:\$		0 CON TOTAL=			O CON TOTAL		636308.00		CON TOTAL=\$	1017750.00
MIN BID =	\$ 636,308.00	A	CTUAL TOTAL=:\$ BID RANKING		0 BID RANKING		841000.00 3	BID RANKIN		636308.00 1		ACT TOTAL=\$ BID RANKING	1017750.00
TANK TOTALS -	BASE BID		\$	712,350.00		\$	1,178,500.00		\$	879,722.00		\$	707,365.00
	GARTMAN TANK CHESTNUT RIDGE TANK		\$	224,350.00 164,000.00		\$ \$	361,500.00 247,000.00		\$ \$	218,807.00 176,515.00		9	156,515.00
	STURGEON POINT EAST CLEARWELL TANK		\$	162,000.00		\$	285,000.00		\$	242,200.00		9	157,550.00
	STURGEON POINT WEST CLEARWELL TANK		\$	162,000.00		\$	285,000.00		\$	242,200.00		\$,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
ALTERNATE BID	DS TO INCLUDE GARTMAN TANK	Include?	\$	649,000.00		\$	841,000.00		\$	636,308.00		\$	1,017,750.00
1.1A 1.8A	Interior Painting - In lieu of item 1.1 for Full Recoat Disposal of Wet Interior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	YES YES	¹ \$	270,000.00 8,000.00		\$ \$	450,000.00 1,000.00		\$ \$	256,410.00 6,100.00		9	. ,
	CHESTNUT RIDGE TANK		·							,			,
2.5A	Exterior Painting - Shell Spot Repair & Shell Overcoat STURGEON POINT EAST CLEARWELL TANK	YES	\$	123,000.00		\$	100,000.00		\$	126,518.00		\$,
3.4A	Exterior Painting - Architectural Coating STURGEON POINT WEST CLEARWELL TANK	YES	\$	124,000.00		\$	145,000.00		\$	123,640.00		\$	224,250.00
4.4A	Exterior Painting - Architectural Coating	YES	\$	124,000.00		\$	145,000.00		\$	123,640.00		\$	224,250.00
TANK TOTALS -	BASE BID & SELECTED ALTERNATES		\$, .,		\$	1,844,500.00		\$			\$	1,675,665.00
	GARTMAN TANK CHESTNUT RIDGE TANK		² \$	370,350.00 287,000.00		\$ \$	637,500.00 347,000.00		\$ \$	387,705.00 303,033.00		9	377,315.00 5 534,750.00
	STURGEON POINT EAST CLEARWELL TANK STURGEON POINT WEST CLEARWELL TANK		\$	286,000.00 286,000.00		\$	430,000.00 430,000.00		\$	365,840.00 365,840.00		9	381,800.00
	This line item includes the value of Item 1.1A as presented the bid documents. No adjustement I	nos hoon made to this walls	•		<u> </u>	φ	700,000.00		φ	000,040.00			, 001,000.00
	1 this line item includes the value of item 1.1A as presented the bid documents. No adjustement if 2 If Alternate Item 1.1A is chose, this line item includes the value of 1.1A in lieu of Item 1.1. AKA ti			r requirement or item 1.1.	Δ.								

BASE BID

PROJECT: Ridge, Sturgeon Point Clearwells
CONTRACT: W-035A
DATE: February 16, 2024

TABULATION OF BIDS PAGE 1

++ INDICATES CONTRACTOR ERROR					Atlas Painting Amh	IO. 2 & Sheeting Corp erst, NY Yes	Worldwide Indu	O. 3 stries Corporation er, PA ′es
TEM#	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY UNITS	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL	UNIT PRICE		UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL
	GARTMAN TANK							
1.1	Interior Painting - Spot Repair & Sacrificial Anode System	1 LS		\$ 132,000.00			\$ 93,612.00	
1.2	Shell Plate and Floor Repair - Cover Plate	2 SF		\$ 600.00	0 \$ 3,000.00		\$ 900.00	
1.3	Steel Plate Butt Weld Repair	5 LS	\$ 150.00		0 \$ 700.00			
1.4	Pit Welding	10 EA		\$ 200.00	0 \$ 500.00		\$ 40.00	
1.5	Epoxy Seam Sealing & Pit Filling	2 GAL		\$ 800.00	0 \$ 1,000.00	. , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	\$ 1,000.00	. ,
1.6	Miscellanious Modifications	1 LS		\$ 60,000.00			\$ 90,320.00	
1.7	Contingency Allowance for Repairs (LUMP SUM)	1 LS	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	0 \$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00 0	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00
	CHESTNUT RIDGE TANK							
2.1	Exterior Painting - Roof Spot Repair and Roof Overcoat	1 LS	\$ 57,200.00	\$ 57,200.00	0 \$ 120,000.00	\$ 120,000.00 0	\$ 37,940.00	\$ 37,940.00
2.2	Disposal of Exterior Hazardous Residue for Spot Repair	1 LS	\$ 1,800.00	\$ 1,800.00	0 \$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00 0	\$ 3,700.00	\$ 3,700.00
2.3	Miscellanious Modifications	1 LS		\$ 55,000.00	0 \$ 76,000.00	\$ 76,000.00 0	\$ 84,875.00	\$ 84,875.00
2.4	Contingency Allowance for Repairs (LUMP SUM)	1 LS	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	0 \$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00 0	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00
	STURGEON POINT EAST CLEARWELL TANK							
3.1	Exterior Cleaning	1 LS	\$ 72,000.00	\$ 72,000.00	0 \$ 145,000.00	\$ 145,000.00 0	\$ 125,500.00	\$ 125,500.00
3.2	Miscellanious Modifications	1 LS		\$ 70,000.00	0 \$ 120,000.00	\$ 120,000.00 0	\$ 96,700.00	\$ 96,700.00
3.3	Contingency Allowance for Repairs (LUMP SUM)	1 LS	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	0 \$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00 0	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00
	STURGEON POINT WEST CLEARWELL TANK							
1.1	Exterior Cleaning	1 LS	\$ 72,000.00	\$ 72,000.00	0 \$ 145,000.00	\$ 145,000.00 0	\$ 125,500.00	\$ 125.500.00
1.2	Miscellanious Modifications	1 LS		\$ 70,000.00			\$ 96,700.00	,
1.3	Contingency Allowance for Repairs (LUMP SUM)	1 LS		\$ 20,000.00			\$ 20,000.00	
			CTOR TOTAL=:\$	712350.00	0 CON TOTAL=\$	1178000.00 ++		879722.00
		AC	TUAL TOTAL=:\$	712350.00	ACT TOTAL=\$	1178500.00	ACT TOTAL=\$	879722.00
MIN BID =	\$ 712,350.00		BID RANKING	1	BID RANKING	3	BID RANKING	2

ALTERNATE BID ITEMS

PROJECT: ECWA Storage Tank Refurbishing: Gartman, Chestnut Ridge, Stur
CONTRACT: W-035A
DATE: =bidtab!C4

TABULATION OF BIDS

PAGE 1

++ INDICATES CONTRACTOR ERROR			NO. 1 Amstar of WNY, Inc. Cheektowaga, NY Yes		Atlas Painting & Amhe	O. 2 & Sheeting Corp rst, NY es	NO. 3 Worldwide Industries Corporation Butler, PA Yes	
ITEM#	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY UNITS	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL
1.1A 1.8A	GARTMAN TANK Interior Painting - In lieu of item 1.1 for Full Recoat Disposal of Wet Interior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	1 LS 1 LS	270,000.00 8,000.00	270,000.00 8,000.00	450,000.00 1,000.00	450,000.00 0 1,000.00 0		256,410.00 6,100.00
2.5A	CHESTNUT RIDGE TANK Exterior Painting - Shell Spot Repair & Shell Overcoat	1 LS	123,000.00	123,000.00	100,000.00	100,000.00 0	126,518.00	126,518.00
3.4A	STURGEON POINT EAST CLEARWELL TANK Exterior Painting - Architectural Coating	1 LS	124,000.00	124,000.00	145,000.00	145,000.00 0	123,640.00	123,640.00
4.4A	STURGEON POINT WEST CLEARWELL TANK Exterior Painting - Architectural Coating	1 LS	124,000.00	124,000.00	145,000.00	145,000.00 0	123,640.00	123,640.00
MIN BID =	\$ 636,308.00	AC	CTOR TOTAL=:\$ TUAL TOTAL=:\$ BID RANKING	649000.00 649000.00 2	O CON TOTAL=\$ ACT TOTAL=\$ BID RANKING	841000.00	CON TOTAL=\$ ACT TOTAL=\$ BID RANKING	636308.00 636308.00 1

ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY AUTHORIZATION FORM

For Approval/Execution of Documents (check which apply)

Contract: W-035-A Project No.: 2023000 Project Description: Storage Tank Refurbishing – Gartman, Chestnut R WTP Clearwells		d Sturgeon Point
Itam Descriptions		
Item Description: Agreement Professional Service Contract Amendment		Change Order
BCD NYSDOT Agreement Contract Docume	nts	Addendum
X Recommendation for Award of Contract Recommendation		
Request for Proposals		
Other		
Action Requested:		
Board Authorization to Execute X Legal Approval		
X Board Authorization to Award Execution by the Ch	airman	
Board Authorization to Advertise for Bids Execution by the Sec	cretary to	the Authority
Board Authorization to Solicit Request for Proposals		
Other		
Approvals Needed:		
APPROVED AS TO CONTENT:		
X Sr. Production Engineer	Date:	3/12/2024 03/12/2024
X Chief Operating Officer	Date:	
X Executive Engineer Jemay 4. Monadle	Date:	3/12/2024
X Director of Administration () avong the Steel	Date:	<u>03/12/2024</u> <u>3/12/2024</u>
X Risk Manager Wolly Thusana	Date:	03/12/2024
X Chief Financial Officer X Legal Wark Carney	Date:	
APPROVED FOR BOARD RESOLUTION:	Date.	03/12/2024
X Secretary to the Authority	Date:	3/12/2024
Remarks:		

Item No:

Resolution Date:

ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY RECOMMENDATION FOR AWARD OF CONTRACT

Contract: Project Description:	W-035-A Storage Tank Refurbish	ning – Gartman,	Project No.: Chestnut Ridge, S	20230 turgeon Po	
CONTRACT AWAR Contractor/Supplier: Award Amount:	D Amstar of WNY, Inc. \$1,229,350.00				
BID SUMMARY: Date Advertised for E	Bids: 1/22/2024		Date of Bid Open	ning 2/13	3/2024
Bi Amstar of WNY, I Worldwide Industr Atlas Painting and	ries Corp.		-	otal Bid A \$1,229,3 \$1,422,4 \$1,844,5	250.00 118.00
Attachments:	X Bid Tabulation		X Consultant's	Recommo	endation
Fu	Waiver Il Waiver rtial Waiver	Havonya	Lote	_ Date _	03/15/2024
INSURANCE APPROXIMATION IN INSURANCE APPROXIMATI		Molly Jo	Musera	_ Date _	3/12/2024
	PPRENTICESHIP PROC f Employee Relations	GRAM APPROV	VAL	_ Date _	03/11/2024
Remarks:					