



# ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY

## INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

May 6, 2022

To: Terrence D. McCracken, Secretary to the Authority

From: Clayton J. Johnson, Production Engineer *CJJ*

Subject: Contract W-034-A  
Storage Tank Refurbishing – Rice Hill, Wohlhueter, Crestwood  
ECWA Project No. 202100193

On Tuesday, April 28, 2022, the Authority received two (2) bids for the above referenced contract. The bids have been reviewed, a mathematical check has been performed, and the apparent lowest acceptable bidder is Amstar of Western New York, Inc. (Amstar). Attached is a bid tabulation sheet for your use and information.

We have reviewed the references for Amstar. Amstar is an established contractor who has performed similar work for several Authority water storage tank rehabilitation projects in an acceptable manner. They have a good understanding of the scope and requirements for this contract.

Amstar provided adequate WMBE documentation, approved by Director of EEO (ECWA), insurance, approved by Claims Representative/Risk Manager, and proof of apprenticeship program, approved by the Secretary to the Authority.

The three tanks are owned by the Town of Boston and operated/maintained by the Authority as part of a Lease Management agreement. A signed Cooperative Agreement dated July 8, 2021 for the construction costs has been received from the Town of Boston. The total bid cost for the rehabilitation of Rice Hill Tank is \$297,910.00, Wohlhueter Tank - \$481,600.00, and Crestwood Tank - \$234,280.00 (base plus Alternate Bid). This is less than the \$635,000.00, 815,000.00, and \$375,000.00 respective values specified in the Cooperative Agreement. The Town of Boston Supervisor was made aware of the bid results.

We, therefore, recommend award of Contract W-034-A to Amstar of Western New York, Inc. in the amount of \$1,013,790.00, subject to legal review. The rehabilitation of the Wohlhueter Tank will occur in Fall 2022 and the rehabilitation of the Rice Hill and Crestwood Tanks will occur in Spring 2023.

Attached are the following documents:

1. ECWA Authorization Form.
2. ECWA Recommendation for Award of Contract form.
3. Consultant recommendation letter dated May 6, 2022 and Bid Tabulation.

### **Budget Information (work to be completed/paid in 2022 and 2023):**

- Department 250 Engineering/Construction
- Unit 2502 Construction
- Item No. 74 Payments to Contractors -Tanks

CJJ:jmf

Attachments

cc: R.Stoll

L.Kowalski

M.Wymer

L.Lester

CONT-W-034-A-2101-X-12



ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY  
AUTHORIZATION FORM  
For Approval/Execution of Documents  
(check which apply)

**Contract:** W-034-A

**Project No.:** 202100193

**Project Description:** Storage Tank Refurbishing – Rice Hill, Wohlhueter, Crestwood.

**Item Description:**








- |  |  |  |                                       |
|--|--|--|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Agreement                                       | <input type="checkbox"/> Professional Service Contract | <input type="checkbox"/> Amendment                     | <input type="checkbox"/> Change Order |
| <input type="checkbox"/> BCD   | <input type="checkbox"/> NYSDOT Agreement              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Contract Documents | <input type="checkbox"/> Addendum     |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Recommendation for Award of Contract | <input type="checkbox"/> Recommendation to Reject Bids |  |                                       |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Request for Proposals                           |  |  |                                       |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____                                     |  |  |                                       |

**Action Requested:**

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Board Authorization to Execute                       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Legal Approval                   |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Board Authorization to Award              | <input type="checkbox"/> Execution by the Chairman                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Board Authorization to Advertise for Bids            | <input type="checkbox"/> Execution by the Secretary to the Authority |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Board Authorization to Solicit Request for Proposals |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____  |  |

**Approvals Needed:**

**APPROVED AS TO CONTENT:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Sr. Production Engineer	<u></u>	Date: <u>5/9/2022</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chief Operating Officer	<u></u>	Date: <u>5/9/22</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Executive Engineer	<u></u>	Date: <u>05/09/2022</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Director of Administration	<u></u>	Date: <u>05/09/2022</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Risk Manager	<u></u>	Date: <u>05/09/2022</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chief Financial Officer	<u></u>	Date: <u>05/09/2022</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Legal	<u></u>	Date: <u>5/9/2022</u>

**APPROVED FOR BOARD RESOLUTION:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Secretary to the Authority	<u></u>	Date: <u>5/9/22</u>
--	--	---------------------

**Remarks:** Unit price contract.

**Resolution Date:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Item No:** \_\_\_\_\_





May 6, 2022

Mr. Clayton Johnson, PE  
 Erie County Water Authority  
 3030 Union Road  
 Cheektowaga, NY 14227-1097

**SUBJECT: ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY  
 STORAGE TANK REFURBISHING  
 RICE HILL, WOHLHUETER, CRESTWOOD  
 CONTRACT No.: W-034A  
 RECOMMENDATION OF AWARD  
 ECWA PROJ. NO. 202100193  
 WENDEL PROJ. NO. 239843**

Dear Mr. Johnson:

Two (2) bids on the above referenced project were received and opened on Thursday, April 28, 2022, in accordance with the Notice to Bidders previously authorized.

A summary of the bids was provided on May 3, 2022 and is attached for your reference. After review of the bids, Wendel recommends award of the Base Bid and Alternate Bid Item No. 3.7A for Contract No. W-034A Storage Tank Refurbishing: Rice Hill, Wohlhueter, Crestwood to Amstar of Western New York, Inc. (Amstar) based upon their low Base Bid and Alternate Item No. 3.7A of \$1,013,790.00.

Base Bid Amount	\$969,900.00
Alternate Bid Item No. 3.7A	<u>\$43,890.00</u>
	\$1,013,790.00

We have had a discussion with Amstar and reviewed their understanding of the scope and requirements of this project. We are confident that they have a clear understanding of the project and they indicated that they are comfortable with their bid price.

Sincerely,  
 WENDEL

Timothy G. Walck, PE




Enclosure

CC via email: Michael Wymer, PE – ECWA  
 Leonard Kowalski, PE – ECWA  
 Catherine Knab, PE, PMP – JMD

Jaime Davidson, PE – JMD  
 Lauren Glose, PE - Wendel



**ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY  
RECOMMENDATION FOR AWARD OF CONTRACT**

Contract:		W-034-A		Project No.:		202100193	
Project Description:		Storage Tank Refurbishing Rice Hill, Wohlhueter, Crestwood					
CONTRACT AWARD							
Contractor/Supplier:		Amstar of Western New York, Inc.					
Award Amount:		\$1,013,790.00					
BID SUMMARY:							
Date Advertised for Bids:				Date of Bid Opening			
04/05/2022				04/28/2022			
Bidder				Total Bid Amount			
Amstar of Western New York, Inc.				\$1,013,790.00			
MGM Insulation, Inc..				**\$1,169,000.00			
				** Corrected amount			
Attachments:		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Bid Tabulation		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Consultant's Recommendation			
APPROVALS (Select applicable)							
WMBE APPROVAL							
<input type="checkbox"/>		No Waiver					
<input type="checkbox"/>		Full Waiver					
<input type="checkbox"/>		Partial Waiver					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		Affirmative Action Officer				Date	
						05/09/2022	
INSURANCE APPROVAL							
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		Claims Rep/Risk Manager				Date	
						05/09/2022	
NYS CERTIFIED APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAM APPROVAL							
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		Secretary to the Authority				Date	
						5/9/22	
Remarks:							



<b>PROJECT : PN 202100193 ECWA Storage Tank Refurbishing: Rice Hill, Wohlhueter, Crestwood</b> <b>CONTRACT W-034A Rebid</b> <b>BID ADV.: 4/05/22</b> <b>BID OPENING: 4/28/2022</b>									
<b>TABULATION OF BIDS WITH ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE</b>									
++ INDICATES CONTRACTOR ERROR									
<b>BASE BID</b>									
<b>ITEM #</b>	<b>DESCRIPTION</b>	<b>QUANTITY</b>	<b>UNITS</b>	<b>NO. 1 Amstar of WNY, Inc. Cheektowaga, NY</b>		<b>NO. 2 MGM Insulation Rochester, NY</b>		<b>NO. 3 Engineer's Estimate (without additional contingency)</b>	
				<b>UNIT</b>	<b>EXTENDED</b>	<b>UNIT</b>	<b>EXTENDED</b>	<b>UNIT</b>	<b>EXTENDED</b>
				<b>PRICE</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>PRICE</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>PRICE</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>
1.1	WOHLHUETER TANK								
	Interior Paint	1	LS	\$ 209,859.00	\$ 209,859.00	0	\$ 246,600.00	\$ 246,600.00	0
1.2	Exterior Painting - Roof Overcoat	1	LS	\$ 149,341.00	\$ 149,341.00	0	\$ 139,000.00	\$ 139,000.00	0
1.3	Disposal of Wet Interior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	1	LS	\$ 500.00	\$ 500.00	0	\$ -	\$ -	0
1.4	Disposal of Exterior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	1	LS	\$ 500.00	\$ 500.00	0	\$ -	\$ -	0
1.5	Pit Welding	10	EA	\$ 20.00	\$ 200.00	0	\$ 500.00	\$ 500.00	++
1.6	Epoxy Seam Sealing and Pit Filling	3	GAL	\$ 400.00	\$ 1,200.00	0	\$ 300.00	\$ 900.00	0
1.7	Miscellaneous Modifications	1	LS	\$ 33,000.00	\$ 33,000.00	0	\$ 85,000.00	\$ 85,000.00	0
1.8	Containment	1	LS	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 27,000.00	0	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	0
1.9	Contingency Allowance for Repairs ( LUMP SUM)	1	LS	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	0	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	0
2.1	RICE HILL TANK								
	Interior Paint	1	LS	\$ 177,210.00	\$ 177,210.00	0	\$ 156,000.00	\$ 156,000.00	0
2.2	Exterior Painting - Roof Overcoat	1	LS	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	0	\$ 37,000.00	\$ 37,000.00	0
2.3	Disposal of Wet Interior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	1	LS	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	0	\$ -	\$ -	0
2.4	Roof Repair /Steel Inforcement	1	LS	\$ 17,000.00	\$ 17,000.00	0	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	0
2.5	Shell Plate & Floor Repair	10	SF	\$ 350.00	\$ 3,500.00	0	\$ 300.00	\$ 3,000.00	0
2.6	Steel Plate Butt Weld Repair	3	LF	\$ 300.00	\$ 900.00	0	\$ 50.00	\$ 150.00	0
2.7	Pit Welding	30	EA	\$ 10.00	\$ 300.00	0	\$ 50.00	\$ 1,500.00	0
2.8	Epoxy Seam Sealing and Pit Filling	5	GAL	\$ 200.00	\$ 1,000.00	0	\$ 300.00	\$ 1,500.00	0
2.9	Miscellaneous Modifications	1	LS	\$ 55,000.00	\$ 55,000.00	0	\$ 73,850.00	\$ 73,850.00	0
2.1	Contingency Allowance for Repairs ( LUMP SUM)	1	LS	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	0	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	0
3.1	CRESTWOOD TANK								
	Interior Paint	1	LS	\$ 7,975.00	\$ 7,975.00	0	\$ 11,900.00	\$ 11,900.00	0
3.2	Disposal of Wet Interior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	1	LS	\$ 110.00	\$ 110.00	0	\$ 100.00	\$ 100.00	0
3.3	Exterior Cleaning	1	LS	\$ 36,850.00	\$ 36,850.00	0	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	0
3.4	Concrete Spall Repair	1	LS	\$ 10,725.00	\$ 10,725.00	0	\$ 14,000.00	\$ 14,000.00	0
3.5	Miscellaneous Modifications	1	LS	\$ 114,730.00	\$ 114,730.00	0	\$ 123,000.00	\$ 123,000.00	0
3.6	Contingency Allowance for Repairs ( LUMP SUM)	1	LS	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	0	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	0
				CONTRACTOR TOTAL=\$ 969,900.00		0	CON TOTAL=\$ 1,124,000.00		++
MIN BID = #REF!				ACTUAL TOTAL=\$ 969,900.00			ACT TOTAL=\$ 1,128,500.00		
				BID RANKING 1			BID RANKING 2		
<b>ALTERNATE BID</b>									
3.7A	CRESTWOOD TANK								
	Exterior painting - Architectural Coating	1	LS	\$ 43,890.00	\$ 43,890.00	0	\$ 45,000.00	\$ 45,000.00	0
				CON TOTAL=\$ 43,890.00		0	CON TOTAL=\$ 45,000.00		0
MIN BID = \$ 42,240.00				ACTUAL TOTAL=\$ 43,890.00		0	ACT TOTAL=\$ 45,000.00		0
				BID RANKING 1			BID RANKING 2		
<b>TANK TOTALS - BASE BID</b>				\$ 969,900.00		0	\$ 1,124,000.00		++
RICE HILL				\$ 481,600.00			\$ 582,000.00		
WOHLHUETER				\$ 297,910.00			\$ 177,000.00		
CRESTWOOD				\$ 190,390.00			\$ 209,000.00		
<b>TANK TOTALS - ALTERNATE BID</b>				\$ 43,890.00		0	\$ 45,000.00		0
CRESTWOOD				\$ 43,890.00			\$ 45,000.00		
<b>TANK TOTALS - BASE BID &amp; ALTERNATES</b>				\$ 1,013,790.00		0	\$ 1,169,000.00		++
RICE HILL				\$ 481,600.00			\$ 582,000.00		
WOHLHUETER				\$ 297,910.00			\$ 177,000.00		
CRESTWOOD				\$ 234,280.00			\$ 254,000.00		
MIN BID = \$ 1,013,790.00				BID RANKING 1			BID RANKING 2		